

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: West/Centre Area
Date: 19 March 2009

Ward: Micklegate
Parish: Micklegate Planning Panel

Reference: 05/00097/CAC
Application at: All Saints Church North Street York
For: Demolition of church hall in the Conservation Area
By: PCC Of All Saints Church
Application Type: Conservation Area Consent
Target Date: 16 March 2005

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 All Saints Church Hall , North Street comprises a single storey brick built Victorian structure in some disrepair adjacent to All Saints Church North Street and All Saints Cottages Listed Buildings and lying in a prominent location within the Historic Core Conservation Area. Conservation Area Consent is sought for demolition of the structure to be replaced by a modest housing development planning permission for which has been sought under 05/00048/FUL.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area Central Historic Core 0038

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

Fluvial Flooding Flooding Areas 0234

2.2 Policies:

CYHE2
Development in historic locations

CYHE3
Conservation Areas

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL:-

3.1 Highway Regulation raise no objection to the proposal.

3.2 Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development raise no objection to the proposal providing some form of Community Use is retained on site and the successor scheme is of sufficient architectural merit.

EXTERNAL:-

3.3 Micklegate Planning Panel raise no objection to the proposal.

4.0 APPRAISAL

KEY ISSUES :-

4.1 Impact of the loss of the existing building on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area

The architectural merit of the replacement scheme in relation to the setting of adjacent Listed Buildings and the wider street scene.

IMPACT OF THE LOSS OF THE EXISTING BUILDING ON THE CHARACTER AND APPEARANCE OF THE CONSERVATION AREA;

4.2 Policy HE3 of the York Development Control Local Plan sets a firm policy presumption that proposals for the demolition of unlisted buildings within Conservation Areas would only be permitted where there would be no adverse effect on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. The current proposal envisages the demolition of the existing parish room a low rise late 19th century brick built structure of in-different townscape quality and its replacement with two two storey residential properties together with a community room with a flat above (subject of planning application ref:05/00048/FUL). The existing building is in severe disrepair with evidence of severe structural movement, decaying brickwork and pointing, failure of large areas of the roofing material and infestations of both dry rot and wet rot. The applicant has established that the cost of returning the building to a usable condition would substantially exceed the income it would generate making due allowances for its townscape value. The demolition of the existing building and its replacement with the proposed re-development scheme would not harm the character or appearance of the Historic Core Conservation Area and the terms of Policy HE3 would thus be complied with.

IMPACT OF THE PROPOSAL ON THE SETTING OF ADJACENT LISTED BUILDINGS;

4.3 Policy HE2 of the York Development Control Local Plan sets a firm policy presumption requiring new development proposals within Conservation Areas and the setting of Listed Buildings to respect adjacent buildings and settings and to have

regard to local scale, proportion, detail and materials. The current proposal envisages the replacement of the existing sub-standard church hall with a mix of two storey dwellings and a community room with a flat over. The existing building by its alien design and massing and poor state of repair materially detracts from the setting of All Saints Church together with All Saints Cottages. The demolition of the building and its replacement with the proposed re-development would secure compliance with the terms of Policy HE2 of the York Development Control Local Plan.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 All Saints Church Hall North Street comprises a single storey low rise brick built Victorian structure in some considerable disrepair. It is of no particular townscape merit but lies within a prominent location within the Historic Core Conservation Area and the setting of All Saints Church and All Saints Cottages Listed Buildings. The proposals envisage the demolition of the existing building and its replacement with a development of two dwellings and a community room with flat over on the cleared site. This would secure the preservation and enhancement of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area as a consequence approval of Conservation Area Consent is recommended.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)

2 DEM1 No demolition before rebuilding contract

3 No work shall commence on site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of recording of the building to be demolished (including publication by an approved archaeological unit) in accordance with the specification supplied by the Local Planning Authority. This programme and the archaeological unit shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before development commences.

Reason: The site lies within an Area of Archaeological Importance and the development may affect important archaeological features which must be recorded prior to destruction.

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to impact upon the character and appearance of the

Historic Core Conservation Area and the setting of All Saints North Street and All Saints Cottages Listed Buildings. As such the proposal complies with Policies HE2 and HE3 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft and the policies and advice contained within PPG15 "Planning and the Historic Environment."

Contact details:

Author: Erik Matthews Development Control Officer

Tel No: 01904 551416